



Reflective Teaching Practice: Insight(s) from Indonesia's Pesantren

Bassam Abul A'la^{a)}, Xiaohui Sun^{b)}, Masdar Hilmy^{c)}, Suryani^{d)}

a) University of Dundee, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9586-9555>

b) University of Dundee, <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3614-6960>

c) UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2807-4442>

d) UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9106-1631>

ABSTRAK

Pengajaran reflektif (PR) merupakan salah satu teknik bagi guru untuk meningkatkan profesionalisme dalam proses belajar-mengajar. Indikator ini sudah lama dibahas dan diteliti dalam dunia pendidikan. Namun, belum banyak yang mendalami dunia pesantren yang konteksnya memiliki karakteristik tersendiri. Oleh karena itu, penelitian ini dilakukan untuk menyelidiki bagaimana RT dipraktikkan oleh guru-guru di pesantren Indonesia. Kuesioner kuantitatif melalui google form dan wawancara semi terstruktur dengan diskusi kelompok online (FGD). 19 guru pesantren di Indonesia yang meliputi Jawa, Sumatera dan Sulawesi menjadi responden dalam penelitian ini. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa guru-guru pesantren mempraktikkan tiga jenis refleksi secara positif dengan baik. Keenam indikator RT untuk guru terbukti signifikan. PR di pesantren terbukti menggunakan ajaran Kyai sebagai salah satu strategi untuk meningkatkan kualitas pengajaran. Namun, strategi PR seperti menulis jurnal belum banyak dipilih oleh para guru di pondok pesantren.

ABSTRACT

Reflective teaching (RT) is a strategy used by teachers to improve their professionalism in the learning process. This indicator has long been debated and investigated in the field of education. However, few have examined the realm of Islamic education institutions, which have distinct qualities. As a result, the purpose of this study was conducted to investigate how teachers in Indonesian Islamic education institution implement RT. Quantitative questionnaires were administered via Google Forms, and semi-structured interviews were conducted via online focus group discussions (FGDs). This study included 19 pesantren teachers from Indonesia's Java, Sumatra, and Sulawesi Islands. The findings revealed that pesantren teachers used three types of reflection positively well. All the six RT indicators for teacher were proved to be significant. RT in Islamic education institution has been shown to apply Kyai's guidance as one of several techniques for improving teaching quality. However, the RT technique of writing a journal has not been generally adopted by teachers in pesantren.

KATA KUNCI

Pengajaran reflektif ; Pendidikan Agama Islam ; Pesantren

KEYWORDS

Reflective teaching; Islamic education; Pesantren

A. Introduction

Many researchers have focused their attention on reflective teaching (RT), for example: Hung & Thuy, Bassachs et al and Burbank et al.¹ RT is a group of skills to reflect on an event, which are vital

¹ Do Minh Hung and Pham Trut Thuy, "Reflective Teaching Perceived and Practiced by EFL Teachers - A Case in the South of Vietnam," *International Journal of Instruction* 14, no. 2 (April 1, 2021): 323–44, <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2021.14219a>; Marcel Bassachs et al., "Fostering Critical Reflection in Primary Education through STEAM Approaches," *Education Sciences* 10, no. 12 (December 16, 2020): 384, <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci10120384>; Mary Burbank, Laurie Ramirez, and Alisa Bates, "Critically Reflective Thinking in Urban Teacher Education: A Comparative Case Study of Two Participants' Experiences as Content Area Teachers," *Professional Educator* 36, no. 2 (2012), <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ988205>.

for learning and decision making.² Reflection is a competency that is needed from basic education to higher education because it allows individuals to stay active in their learning process.³ Reflective learning is necessary under the evolving needs of the world, including the changing social and environmental paradigms. In this case, the resources of individuals' new knowledge must also develop by means of continuous inquiring and self-assessment.⁴ In the context of education, knowledge acquirement is not only through inter- and cross-disciplinary approaches and competencies but also requires a transformative instructional approach.⁵ Reflection connects previous and new experiences with existing knowledge and skills, all of which are important in determining individual-specific learning outcomes.⁶ Reflection also contribute to teachers' reasoning procedure of the rationale they apply certain learning strategies and improve their teaching to have a positive effect on students.⁷

Pesantren is an Islamic religious education institution that has a long history in the formal education system in Indonesia.⁸ *Pesantren* is a study center for studying Islamic sciences, especially *fiqh*, *hadith*, and *sufism*.⁹ In Indonesia, it is not uncommon for some people to claim that *pesantren* is unique because it combines intellectualism and mysticism. This uniqueness certainly has its own color as how *pesantren* teachers carry out the learning process. Great leader in *pesantren* has mentioned as *Kyai*.¹⁰

The role of *pesantren* in the history of Islamic religious education in Indonesia has seen in two ways; on the one hand, as an educational institution,¹¹ and on the other, as a place for securitization of Islamic religion.¹² As an educational institution, *pesantren* under the leadership of a *Kyai* can organize

² Bassachs et al., "Fostering Critical Reflection in Primary Education through STEAM Approaches"; Amani Bell et al., "A Critical Evaluation of the Usefulness of a Coding Scheme to Categorise Levels of Reflective Thinking," *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education* 36, no. 7 (December 2011): 797–815, <https://doi.org/10.1080/02602938.2010.488795>.

³ Jordi Colomer et al., "Reflective Learning in Higher Education: Active Methodologies for Transformative Practices," *Sustainability* 12, no. 9 (May 8, 2020): 3827, <https://doi.org/10.3390/su12093827>.

⁴ Talia Stough et al., "Assessing Sustainability in Higher Education Curricula: A Critical Reflection on Validity Issues," 2018, <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.JCLEPRO.2017.02.017>.

⁵ Ángel Alsina et al., "Improving and Evaluating Reflective Narratives: A Rubric for Higher Education Students," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 63 (April 1, 2017): 148–58, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2016.12.015>; Bassachs et al., "Fostering Critical Reflection in Primary Education through STEAM Approaches"; Colomer et al., "Reflective Learning in Higher Education."

⁶ Colomer et al., "Reflective Learning in Higher Education."

⁷ Hea-Jin Lee, "Understanding and Assessing Preservice Teachers' Reflective Thinking," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 21, no. 6 (August 2005): 699–715, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2005.05.007>.

⁸ Ismail Suardi Wekke, "Arabic Teaching and Learning: A Model from Indonesian Muslim Minority," *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 191 (June 2015): 286–90, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.04.236>.

⁹ Ronald Lukens-Bull, "Madrasa By Any Other Name: Pondok, Pesantren, and Islamic Schools in Indonesia and Larger Southeast Asian Region," *Journal Of Indonesian Islam* 4, no. 1 (June 1, 2010): 1, <https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2010.4.1.1-21>.

¹⁰ Raihani, "Report on Multicultural Education in Pesantren," *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education* 42, no. 4 (July 2012): 585–605, <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2012.672255>.

¹¹ Bassam Abul A'la and Moh. Rifqi Rahman, "The Response From Pesantren Recognition in The Configuration of The National Education System," *AJIS: Academic Journal of Islamic Studies* 7, no. 2 (December 27, 2022): 323, <https://doi.org/10.29240/ajis.v7i2.5136>.

¹² Himawan Bayu Patriadi, Mohd. Zaini Abu Bakar, and Zahri Hamat, "Human Security in Local Wisdom Perspective: Pesantren and Its Responsibility to Protect People," *Procedia Environmental Sciences* 28 (2015): 100–105, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.proenv.2015.07.015>.

the learning process dynamically according to conditions and circumstances.¹³ As a recent example, it turns out that *pesantren* (*Kyai*, teachers and students) able to adapt dynamically during the COVID-19 outbreak by adjusting to a supportive and innovative environment in the learning program.¹⁴ Furthermore, Nawas found that *Kyai* and teachers in *pesantren* can create effective learning environments.¹⁵

Pesantren is also a place for securitization of Islamic religion in Indonesia.¹⁶ This is evident from the existence of Islam and *pesantren* as a place to explore Islamic value by maintaining in depth with *kitab kuning* (Islamic classical text). Furthermore, many fatwas and religious decrees are issued by pesantren and its alumni.¹⁷ According to Yusuf and Wekke, this occurs because *santri* (students in *pesantren*) are taught how to think systematically which includes classification, identification, and question proposals.¹⁸ They are trained in an environment that fosters thinking and criticality.

Teachers should carry out reflective activities not only to learn new ideas better but also to maintain professionalism in their teaching and learning process. Teachers are required to develop self-confidence, skills, and knowledge. Knowledge of the subject matter must be continuously updated, expanded, and deepened.¹⁹ However, research by Black (2005),²⁰ Choy and Cheah (2009),²¹ and Choy and Oo (2012)²² have demonstrated that teachers still do not know how to apply RT in learning.

Several studies on RT for teachers have a good effect on their students.²³ RT can improve the knowledge and self-understanding of teachers.²⁴ Lee argues that RT encourages teachers to move from their knowledge base of different skills to a higher stage in the learning process and finally be

¹³ Yusuf Hanafi et al., "The New Identity of Indonesian Islamic Boarding Schools in the 'New Normal': The Education Leadership Response to COVID-19," *Heliyon* 7, no. 3 (March 2021): e06549, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e06549>.

¹⁴ Hanafi et al.

¹⁵ Abu Nawas, I Gusti Ngurah Darmawan, and Nina Maadad, "Single-Sex 'Pesantren' Schools: Unravelling Girls' and Boys' Peer Connections and Their Impacts on Wellbeing and Learning Outcomes.," *International Journal of Educational Research* 125 (2024): 102339, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2024.102339>.

¹⁶ Patriadi, Bakar, and Hamat, "Human Security in Local Wisdom Perspective."

¹⁷ Mohammad Kosim et al., "The Dynamics of Islamic Education Policies in Indonesia," *Cogent Education* 10, no. 1 (December 31, 2023): 2172930, <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2023.2172930>.

¹⁸ Muhammad Yusuf and Ismail Suardi Wekke, "Active Learning on Teaching Arabic for Special Purpose in Indonesian Pesantren," *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 191 (June 2015): 137–41, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.04.245>.

¹⁹ Eric Hoyle and Jacquetta Megarry, eds., *World Yearbook of Education 1980*, 0 ed. (Routledge, 2012), <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203080511>.

²⁰ Susan Black, "Teaching Students to Think Critically," *Education Digest: Essential Readings Condensed for Quick Review* 70, no. 6 (February 2005): 42–4.

²¹ S. Chee Choy and Phaik Kin Cheah, "Teacher Perceptions of Critical Thinking among Students and Its Influence on Higher Education," *International Journal of Research in Science and Technology* 20, no. 2 (2009), <https://doi.org/10.37648/ijrst.v10i04.002>.

²² S. Chee Choy and Pou San Oo, *Reflective Thinking and Teaching Practices: A Precursor for Incorporating Critical Thinking into the Classroom?*, *Online Submission*, vol. 5, 2012, <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED529110>.

²³ Bell et al., "A Critical Evaluation of the Usefulness of a Coding Scheme to Categorise Levels of Reflective Thinking"; Burbank, Ramirez, and Bates, "Critically Reflective Thinking in Urban Teacher Education"; Lee, "Understanding and Assessing Preservice Teachers' Reflective Thinking."

²⁴ Burbank, Ramirez, and Bates, "Critically Reflective Thinking in Urban Teacher Education."

able to find new strategies.²⁵ Thus, RT for teachers becomes increasingly important along with the ability to carry out the learning process in a variety of different environments.²⁶

There have not been many studies on RT for teachers in Pesantren. Generally, RT is still focused mainly on studies related to science and mathematics.²⁷ Based on this anxiety, this study focuses on how RT has been used by teachers at *pesantren* (Islamic education institution).

B. Reflective Teaching

This concept originated as a view of knowledge with ongoing and intentional beliefs.²⁸ Reflection is different from thinking because thinking is innate, and reflection is a skill and habit that can be learned.²⁹ Reflection does not mean thinking about a problem, but has a broader meaning than thinking, which is a recursive process that involves many actions or experiences, and reactions (reflections).³⁰ On the other hand, Schön believes that reflection is a process in which the teacher always acquires some new knowledge from special situations and uncertain situations in teaching.³¹ Thus, reflection is one of the methods of obtaining new knowledge.

In the Islamic context, reflection is a necessity in understanding knowledge. Many verses of the Quran state that man should use deep thinking.³² Although there are several terms of thinking in the Qur'an, in the context of reflection, terms are found *tafakkur*.³³ For example, the Holy Quran tells a man to reflect by saying "This is how Allah makes His revelations clear to you believers, so perhaps you may reflect"(2:219).³⁴ In addition, it says "Say, "Are those blind to the truth equal to those who can

²⁵ Lee, "Understanding and Assessing Preservice Teachers' Reflective Thinking."

²⁶ Bell et al., "A Critical Evaluation of the Usefulness of a Coding Scheme to Categorise Levels of Reflective Thinking."

²⁷ Yusuf Badri, Hepsi Nindiasari, and Abdul Fatah, "Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Interaktif Dengan Scaffolding Metakognitif Untuk Kemampuan Dan Disposisi Berpikir Reflektif Matematis Siswa," *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pembelajaran Matematika* 12, no. 1 (February 19, 2019), <https://doi.org/10.30870/jppm.v12i1.4863>; Santy Yesica Manurung and Tanti Listiani, "Becoming a Reflective Teacher through the Reflective Thinking Process in Mathematics Learning," *Polyglot: Jurnal Ilmiah* 16, no. 1 (January 30, 2020): 58, <https://doi.org/10.19166/pji.v16i1.2262>; Nismawati Nismawati, Hepsi Nindiasari, and Anwar Mutaqin, "Meningkatkan Kemampuan Berpikir Reflektif Matematis Melalui Model Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning Berbasis Lingkungan," *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pembelajaran Matematika* 12, no. 1 (February 19, 2019), <https://doi.org/10.30870/jppm.v12i1.4856>.

²⁸ John Dewey, *How We Think: A Restatement of the Relation of Reflective Thinking to the Educative Process* (Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath, 1933).

²⁹ Dewey.

³⁰ Colomer et al., "Reflective Learning in Higher Education"; Zhaohao Nian, "To Promote the Development of Teachers' Teaching Beliefs from Reflective Teaching," *Open Journal of Social Sciences* 08, no. 11 (2020): 120–26, <https://doi.org/10.4236/jss.2020.811012>.

³¹ Donald A. Schön, *Educating the Reflective Practitioner: Toward a New Design for Teaching and Learning in the Professions*, The Jossey-Bass Higher Education Series (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1990).

³² Sussan Keshavarz, "Quran Point of View on Dimensions of Reflection and Its Indications in Education System," *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 9 (2010): 1812–14, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2010.12.405>.

³³ Kabuye Uthman Sulaiman, "An Exposition of the Islamic Perspective of Reflection: Meaning, Entailment and Significance," *International Journal of Management Studies and Social Science Research* 3, no. 2 (2021).

³⁴ Tim Lajnah Pentashihan Mushaf Al Quran, *Tafsir Ringkas*, 1st ed. (Jakarta: Lajnah Pentashihan Mushaf Al Quran, 2016).

see? Will you not then reflect? (6:50).³⁵ For this reason, Islam recommends doing something with reflection included in the learning process.

Learning is the process that individuals carry out to construct experiences by reflecting on different contexts and environments.³⁶ Reflective learning consists of three elements: Cognitive components, critical thinking, and narrative inquiry.³⁷ First, the cognitive element focuses on how teachers use reflection to improve their knowledge in planning, decision-making, and lifelong learning.³⁸ Fives & Buehl describe lifelong learning for teachers as a continuous experience gaining procedure during which teachers will keep staying at a status of a student in the classroom.³⁹ Secondly, the critical thinking element means analyzing the situations in the classroom and making decisions as solutions to the problems. The third element, narrative inquiry, means looking at the feedback from students on the decisions that teachers has carried out.⁴⁰

Many researchers consider that RT has many benefits in the context of instruction and teaching.⁴¹ First, it raises the awareness of teaching practices. The awareness in question is that the teachers know the advantages and disadvantages of their teaching. This can be done when the teachers are assigned with their own homework. The second benefit of RT for teachers is its reconstruction of teachers' concepts and experiences. There are times when teachers' teaching does not go according to what has been planned. Therefore, restructuring and evaluating the ways, styles, and methods that have been carried out is very important to do. Lastly, RT contributes with developing the professionalism of teachers, including the development of new aspects and practices in their teaching.

³⁵ Tim Lajnah Pentashihan Mushaf Al Quran.

³⁶ Lynne Montrose, "International Study and Experiential Learning: The Academic Context," 2002, <https://doi.org/10.36366/frontiers.v8i1.91>; Monica Pagano and Laura Roselle, "Beyond Reflection through an Academic Lens: Refraction and International Experiential Education," *Frontiers: The Interdisciplinary Journal of Study Abroad* 18 (2009): 217–29.

³⁷ May Britt Postholm, "Teachers Developing Practice: Reflection as Key Activity," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 24, no. 7 (October 2008): 1717–28, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2008.02.024>.

³⁸ Helenrose Fives and Michelle M. Buehl, "Exploring Differences in Practicing Teachers' Valuing of Pedagogical Knowledge Based on Teaching Ability Beliefs," *Journal of Teacher Education* 65, no. 5 (November 2014): 435–48, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487114541813>.

³⁹ Fives and Buehl.

⁴⁰ Nancy Palacios and Alison Kay Reedy, "Teaching Practicums as an Ideal Setting for the Development of Teachers-in-Training.," *Revista Interuniversitaria de Formación Del Profesorado. Continuación de La Antigua Revista de Escuelas Normales* 97, no. 36.1 (April 18, 2022), <https://doi.org/10.47553/rifop.v97i36.1.89267>.

⁴¹ Xeniya S. Artamonova, "Reflective Practices: The Experiences of Teachers in One NIS School in Kazakhstan" (Kazakhstan, Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education, 2017); Joan M. Ferraro, *Reflective Practice and Professional Development* (American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, 1307 New York Avenue, 2000); Nian, "To Promote the Development of Teachers' Teaching Beliefs from Reflective Teaching"; Andrew Pollard and Kristine Black-Hawkins, *Reflective Teaching in Schools*, 4th edition, Reflective Teaching (London; New York: Bloomsbury, 2014); Nilofar Vazir, "Reflection in Action: Constructing Narratives of Experience," *Reflective Practice* 7, no. 4 (November 2006): 445–54, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623940600987015>.

In addition, RT has a strong foundation in Islamic pedagogy which may not have been explained systematically and codified in the context of contemporary education.⁴² For example, the teaching methods proposed by Ibn Sina, Al Ghazali, and Al Mawardi do not mention RT in detail but implicitly implied. Speaking of RT, Al Mawardi wrote in his book *Adabu ad Dunnya wa ad Diin* that teachers must have *firaasat* (hunches) and reflective skill to map the abilities of each student.⁴³ Hence, teachers can make decisions on what methods, materials, and approaches to use to teach.⁴⁴

In previous study, Schön stated that there are two forms of reflective teaching: Reflection after action and reflection in action.⁴⁵ Reflection after action means that teachers reflect on the action after the end of teaching. Teachers try to analyze whether the teaching activity is going well. Teachers would also seek other alternatives to achieving better delivery of their teaching content. In this case, teachers make their own judgments or ask others for help to assess their teaching process.⁴⁶

Reflection in action means that teachers can modify the teaching directly. Teachers interactively make decisions about the teaching process when they notice there exists some weakness. The teachers must reflect and take actions to improve their teaching at the same time.⁴⁷ Killion and Todnem extend the two reflection models by adding reflection for action.⁴⁸ In this model, the teachers not only use a reflection in solving the problems that occur during the teaching process, but also considers the possibilities that occur in the days to come.

This reflection is based on the thoughts and actions of the past as a spectacle to face the future. The six dimensions among RT are the following:

1. Practical: This involves the act of reflection using instruments such as learning journals or sharing with other teachers. This component includes items related to reflection tools and practices. Tools commonly used for reflective practice include writing journals, lesson reports, surveys and questionnaires, audio and video recordings, observations, teaching portfolios, group discussions, and analyzing incidents.⁴⁹

⁴² Nadeem Memon, "What Islamic School Teachers Want: Towards Developing an Islamic Teacher Education Programme," *British Journal of Religious Education* 33, no. 3 (September 2011): 285–98, <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2011.595912>.

⁴³ Abu al Hasan Ali bin Muhammad Mawardi al, *Adabu ad Dunnya wa ad Diin*, 1st ed., vol. 1 (Konstantinopel: Jawaib Press, 1882).

⁴⁴ Bassam Abul A'la, "The ideal teacher from the perspective of Abu Hasan Al Mawardi" (Ponorogo, Institut Studi Islam Darussalam (ISID) Gontor, 2016), https://scholar.google.co.id/citations?view_op=view_citation&hl=en&user=YNEY644AAAAJ&citation_for_view=YNEY644AAAAJ:qjMakFHDy7sC.

⁴⁵ Schön, *Educating the Reflective Practitioner*.

⁴⁶ Schön.

⁴⁷ Bassachs et al., "Fostering Critical Reflection in Primary Education through STEAM Approaches."

⁴⁸ Joellen P. Killion and Guy R. Todnem, "A Process for Personal Theory Building.," *Educational Leadership* 48 (1991): 14–16.

⁴⁹ Muhamad Ahsanu, "Reflective Practice and Teaching Creativity of Indonesian ELT Practitioners within the Postmethod Paradigm," in *Proceedings of the ProcCulture, Education, Linguistics and Literature*, vol. I (First International Conference on Culture, Education, Linguistics and Literature, CELL, Purwokerto, Indonesia: EAI, 2019), 123, <https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.5-8-2019.2289784>; Thomas S. C. Farrell, *Reflective Practice in Action: 80 Reflection*

2. Cognitive: This is the conscious efforts to develop the professionalism of teachers by reading books, articles, and attending seminars. This element relates to the efforts of teachers aimed at professional development. Conducting small-scale classroom research projects or action research, attending conferences and workshops related to one's field of study, and reading professional literature some behaviors that fall into this domain (Farrell, 2004).⁵⁰
3. Affective: Actively engage to know the cognitive or affective state of the learner. This component includes items related to the teachers' reflection on his/her students, how they learn and how learners respond, or behave emotionally in their classroom. According to Zeichner & Liston, this dimension emphasizes reflections about students, their cultural and linguistic background, their thinking and understanding, their interests, and their developmental readiness for certain tasks.⁵¹ This element concentrates also on the reflection of the teachers on the emotional response of their students in the classroom.
4. Meta Cognitive: Knowing well the personality of teachers, the meaning of teaching, and views on the profession of them. This component has to do with the teachers and their reflection on their own beliefs and personalities, the way in which they define their exercises, their own emotional makeup, etc.⁵² Knowing the personality of the teachers itself can influence their tendency to engage in reflection and will influence their reaction to their own image resulting from reflection.
5. Critical: Linking learning to the socio-political dimension. This component consists of items that refer to the socio-political aspects of pedagogy and its reflection. The items belonging to this category relate to the reflection of teachers on the political significance of their practice, introduction of topics related to race, gender, and social class, and exploring ways to empower students.⁵³
6. Moral: Concerning questions of fairness, empathy, and moral principles. The topics presented here investigate teachers' perspectives on moral issues. Three strands of reflection take the notion of morality into account. Deliberative approach urges teachers to think critically about their goals and how to justify them from a moral point of view (Hansen, 1998).⁵⁴ The second approach called relational approach refers to moral philosophy and feminist theory centered on individuals' moral life around issues of personal character and how individuals perceive and treat others. The third proximity, called the critical approach.

Breaks for Busy Teachers (Thousand Oaks, Calif: Corwin Press, 2004); Paolo Nino Valdez, Jocelyn Amor Navera, and Jerico Juan Esteron, "What Is Reflective Teaching? Lessons Learned from ELT Teachers from the Philippines," *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher* 27, no. 2 (April 2018): 91–98, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40299-018-0368-3>.

⁵⁰ Farrell, *Reflective Practice in Action*.

⁵¹ Kenneth M. Zeichner and Daniel P. Liston, *Reflective Teaching: An Introduction*, 2. ed, Reflective Teaching and the Social Conditions of Schooling (London: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2014).

⁵² Pollard and Black-Hawkins, *Reflective Teaching in Schools*.

⁵³ Zeichner and Liston, *Reflective Teaching*.

⁵⁴ David T. Hansen, *Exploring the Moral Heart of Teaching: Toward a Teacher's Creed* (New York: Teachers College Press, 2001).

C. Methodology

1. Method

This study conducts survey research for the RT of teachers in pesantren.⁵⁵ The adopted data collection instruments include questionnaires, interviews, and documentation. Questionnaires are used to collect quantitative data to answer questions about RT practices. Semi-structured interviews and teaching documents in Islamic boarding schools were also used for data triangulation.

The questionnaire made by Akbari became reference in this study.⁵⁶ Teachers are asked to answer questions categorized into parts that included via google form. The adoption of google forms is to make it easier for researchers to obtain data, which would be brought by the distance amongst pesantren spreading throughout Indonesia. The first four demographic items aim to obtain information about teaching experience, subjects, boarding school areas, and academic qualifications. The second part contains 24 statements from six indicators of reflective teaching. The RT Instrument used are practical (PC), cognitive (CG), affective (AF), metacognitive (MC), critical (CT), moral (MO).

The answers to each question are represented with a Likert scale of scores from 1 to 5, which have meanings in the order of never, rarely, sometimes, often, and always.⁵⁷ The initial results of the questionnaire were used to develop the themes of questions in the pseudo-structured interview.

There are three main questions for teachers about RT accordingly:

1. Do you always think about your teaching?
2. What strategies do you use to reflect on your teaching?
3. What activities do you think can improve RT?

2. Participants

The criteria for selecting participants and the origin of pesantren are determined based on the ease of access and representation of Indonesian territory. The selection of *Pondok Modern Darussalam Gontor Ponorogo* (PMDG) as a representation of the Indonesian territory because there are 20 Islamic boarding schools located in Java, Sumatra, and Sulawesi.⁵⁸ The number of teachers involved is 19. The number of teachers who can fill out such questionnaires is very limited, since teachers who can access online questionnaires are only sixth year or teachers at the upper level, which is equivalent to third grade in normal schools.

⁵⁵ John W. Creswell and Vicki L. Plano Clark, *Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research*, Third Edition (Los Angeles: SAGE, 2018).

⁵⁶ Ramin Akbari, Foad Behzadpoor, and Babak Dadvand, "Development of English Language Teaching Reflection Inventory," *System* 38, no. 2 (June 2010): 211–27, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2010.03.003>.

⁵⁷ Kushal Anjaria, "Knowledge Derivation from Likert Scale Using Z-Numbers," *Information Sciences* 590 (April 2022): 234–52, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ins.2022.01.024>.

⁵⁸ Pondok Modern Darussalam Gontor, "Sejarah Latar Belakang Pondok Modern Darussalam Gontor," <https://www.gontor.ac.id>, August 25, 2020, <https://www.gontor.ac.id/latar-belakang>.

3. *Data collection and analysis*

Data collection began with the distribution of questionnaires. Then a detailed and in-depth personal interview was conducted. The data analysis technique in this study is SPSS software version 20. Descriptive statistic test analysis is carried out to determine the mean, average, value, maximum, minimum, and standard deviation. The interview and teaching documents are fully and critically analyzed by the researcher. Finally, the data is interpreted and analyzed with reference to the results of the questionnaire.⁵⁹

D. Results

In this section, the results collected from questionnaires, interviews, and teaching documents will be analyzed together. Based on the results of the calculation of the length of the class of each interval, in Table 1 is presented a classification of the categories of assessment against the calculated average value.

Table 1. Classification of Categories of Appraisal for Descriptive Statistic

Calculated Average Value	Assessment Categories
1 – 1.80	Very Unkind
1.81 – 2.60	Bad
2.61 – 3.20	Good Enough
3.21 – 4.20	Good
4.21 – 5.00	Excellent

Source: Data Processing Results

Based on Table 1, the scale can be used as a reference to provide an assessment of the results of existing questions, which are related to existing variables and discussed in this study. The following is a description of the respondents' perceptions of each variable:

Table 2. Practical Indicators of Reflective Teaching

Item Code	5	4	3	2	1	Average
I write about the experience of teaching in a diary or notebook	1	2	3	2	11	1.9
I discussed the learning process in class with a teacher friend to give suggestions and criticisms	9	5	4	1	0	4.6
After the learning process, I wrote the advantages and disadvantages of the method and the lesson	0	3	5	7	4	2.4
I ask other teachers to observe the learning process and teaching performance	3	4	5	4	3	3.0
Overall average						2.9

Based on the results of the data above, it is known that respondents' responses to the RT practical indicators yielded an average of 2.9. This means that respondents tend to practice RT on

⁵⁹ Sugiyono, *Metode penelitian kuantitatif, kualitatif dan kombinasi (mixed methods)* (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2018).

practical indicators in the category of good enough. The indicator that was rated the highest by respondents was the realization "I discussed the learning process in class with teacher friends to provide suggestions and criticisms" with an average of 4.6 and the lowest indicator rated by respondents was the realization "I write about teaching experience in a diary or notebook" with an average of 1.9.

This result is in line with the statement given by one of the pesantren teachers that after teaching he discussed with fellow teachers about the learning process in class. "After teaching, I usually sit in the office to meet other teachers in order to discuss and tell me about my previous teaching. I usually do that because I want to know if my experience is the same or different from others". Furthermore, when they were asked what the strategy for RT was, most of them said that discussion with friends was an option used in the learning process. In conclusion, *pesantren* teachers had uniformity in the strategies that they already use in the RT practices.

Table 3. Cognitive-Reflective Teaching Indicators

Item Code	5	4	3	2	1	Average
I'm thinking of using a new strategy in the classroom	11	3	4	1	0	4,3
I read an article about effective learning to improve classroom performance	8	5	4	0	2	3,9
I attended seminars related to learning issues	2	3	6	6	2	2,9
I do small-scale research activities in the classroom to get better information about the learning/teaching process	3	6	3	5	2	3,2
Overall Average						3,5

Based on the results of the data above, it is known that respondents' responses to the cognitive indicators of RT produced an average of 3.5. This means that respondents tend to practice RT on cognitive indicators in the good category. The indicator rated the most by respondents was the statement "I am thinking of using a new strategy in the classroom" with an average of 4.3 and the lowest indicator rated by respondents was the statement "I attended seminars related to learning issues" with an average of 2.9.

In these findings, many teachers said they thought about teaching strategies the day before. "Yes, of course I always think about how I teach. Every night before I teach, I look for materials, strategize for my preparation for teaching". This indicates a reflective process in teaching. For example, the teacher's experience when teaching. "I will constantly seek breakthroughs so that the pursuit goes well and meaningfully. Because the strategy I plan the day before class will be different when I face students in class".

Table 4. Affective Reflective Teaching Indicators

Item Code	5	4	3	2	1	Average
I think about the emotional state of learners in the learning process	11	6	2	0	0	4.5
When a learner has a problem, I try to pay more attention to him	9	7	3	0	0	4.3
I ask the learners, whether they like the task or not	5	6	5	2	1	3.6
I ask learners to write down their perceptions of the class and the things they like or don't like in the classroom	1	5	6	6	1	2.9
Average						3.8

Based on the results of the data above, it is known that respondents' responses to the affective RT indicator yielded an average of 3.8. This means that respondents tend to practice reflective teaching on cognitive indicators in the good category. The indicator rated the most by respondents was the statement "I think about the emotional state of learners in the learning process" with an average of 4.5 and the lowest indicator assessed by respondents was the statement "I ask learners to write down their perceptions of the class and the things they like or don't like in the classroom" with an average of 2.9.

As previously stated, the condition of the classroom will be one of the important factors where teachers will implement RT. As additional data, pesantren teachers revealed that classroom conditions every time they teach will be different, this has an impact on the teacher's need to find creative solutions so that teaching runs smoothly. As a result, without the practical ability to apply RT, teaching will not help students to have critical thinking skills.

Table 5. Metacognitive-Reflective Teaching Indicator

Item Code	5	4	3	2	1	Average
As a teacher, I think about the teaching philosophy and how it affects the teaching and learning process	8	6	4	1	0	4.1
I thought about the meaning and significance of work as a teacher	6	7	6	0	0	4.0
I think about my strengths and weaknesses as a teacher	10	5	4	0	0	4.3
I think of the inconsistencies and contradictions that occur in teaching practice	7	6	5	1	0	4.0
Overall Average						4.1

Based on the results of the above data, it is known that respondents' responses to the metacognitive RT indicator yielded an average of 4.1. This means that respondents tend to practice reflective teaching on cognitive indicators in the good category. The indicator rated the most by respondents was the statement "I think about my strengths and weaknesses as a teacher" with an average of 4.3 and the lowest indicator assessed by respondents was the statement "I think about the

meaning and significance of work as a teacher” and “I think about the inconsistencies and contradictions that occur in teaching practice" with an average of 4.0.

The results of the interview data said that the teachers had a sense of belonging to what they did. As the *pesantren* teacher said, "Of course, I always think about that, when I get a teaching schedule I feel a very noble obligation. Therefore, I must prepare and teach all out. In line with what other *pesantren* teachers said that he must be aware that all his behavior will be seen by students and used as role models.

Furthermore, the teachers revealed the fact that they also have an encouraging role model when teaching. "I think that teachers should read a lot and associate lessons with contextual phenomena, so that students can benefit from developing their thinking skills. I am very inspired by *Kyai* who continuously exemplifies that”. Hence, *Kyai* as a role model, his words, behavior, and commands will be seen.

Table 6. Critical Reflective Teaching Indicators

Item Code	5	4	3	2	1	Average
I thought of an example of social injustice in my own environment and tried to discuss it in class	3	5	5	4	2	3.2
I think that gender, social, and cultural issues affect learner achievement	4	1	5	5	4	2.8
I think of ways that learners can change their social lives in the fight against poverty and discrimination	6	5	6	0	2	2.8
I thought of giving concrete examples of each material	4	1	5	5	4	3.7
Overall Average						3.1

Based on the results of the data above, it is known that respondents' responses to the critical RT indicator yielded an average of 3.1. This means that respondents tend to practice reflective teaching on cognitive indicators in the category of quite good. The indicator rated the most highly by respondents was the statement "I think of giving concrete examples of each material" with an average of 3.7 and the lowest indicator assessed by respondents was the statement "I think that gender, social, and cultural issues affect the achievement of learners and I am thinking of ways that learners can change their social lives in the fight against poverty and discrimination" with an average of 2.8.

Another finding states that *pesantren* teachers will provide examples before entering the learning material. “I think that teachers should read a lot and relate lessons to contextual phenomena, so that students can benefit from developing their thinking skills”. This confirms that *pesantren* teachers have done their part of RT.

Table 7. Moral RT Indicators

Item Code	5	4	3	2	1	Average
I consider myself a role model for learners, so I try to act as their role model	12	2	4	2	0	4.3
I set out a clear set of rules for learners to follow in terms of class attendance and the way they will be evaluated	9	5	3	2	0	4.1
I provide equal opportunities for all learners in the class regardless of their abilities	13	3	3	0	0	4.5
I tell the learners moral standards and values	12	5	2	0	0	4.5
Overall Average						4.4

Based on the results of the above data, it is known that respondents' responses to the moral indicators of RT yielded an average of 4.4. This means that respondents tend to practice reflective teaching on moral indicators in the *very good* category. The indicator rated most highly by respondents was the statement "I provide equal opportunities for all learners in the class regardless of their abilities and I tell the learners moral standards and values" with an average of 4.5 and the lowest indicator assessed by respondents was the statement "I set a clear set of rules for learners to follow in terms of class attendance and the way they will be evaluated" with an average of 4.1.

Respondents were taken from active *pesantren* teachers who had been teaching and contributing on Islamic religious material for five years. Amongst the teachers in Gontor Islamic boarding schools throughout Indonesia, there were 19 respondents who were randomly selected. Table 8 shows data on the distribution of respondents from Java, Sumatra, and Sulawesi. The respondents were asked to fill out a questionnaire and join an interview by answering several questions related to RT for teachers.

Table 8. Distribution of respondents

Boarding	Sample
Gontor Java	15
Sumatran Gontor	2
Gontor Sulawesi	2
Total	19

The document investigation found that the number of pesantren teachers who taught sixth grade equivalent to the third grade of high school level is 132 people scattered throughout Islamic boarding schools in Indonesia.⁶⁰ PMDG has become the largest Islamic education institution in Indonesia and is spread throughout the country. Eight Islamic boarding schools are located on the

⁶⁰ Gontor, "Sejarah Latar Belakang Pondok Modern Darussalam Gontor."

island of Java, six pesantren are on the island of Sumatra, and five *pesantren* on the island of Sulawesi. Meanwhile, PMDG alumni have also established many alumni Islamic boarding schools in Indonesia.

Table 9. Results of Teacher Reflective Thinking Scores of Each Dimension

Dimension	N	Mean	SD	Median
Practical	19	11.47	3.486	12
Cognitive	19	14.16	3.760	15
Affective	19	15.37	2.432	16
Meta Cognitive	19	16.42	3.150	17
Critical	19	12.42	4.635	12
Moral	19	17.47	2.796	18

Table 9 describes six homework indicators measured in the Gontor Modern cottage teachers. On the practical aspect, that the teachers are still in the moderate category means a lack of relevant work done by the teachers ($M = 11.47$). These results are contrary to the documents in the curriculum of modern cottage education. The document analysis found that teachers should participate in a material insight development program at a forum called *ta'hil*. The program is a place where teachers meet other teachers of the same subject in one room. This activity brought in an expert in the subject as a resource person to deepen the material and relate to contemporary phenomena.

An interview with one of the teachers also revealed that in *ta'hil* activities, the material to be taught by the teachers was associated with relevant examples on the spot. As excerpted from the following results: "*Indeed, ta'hil activities are very useful tadz, because ana understands the lessons that one wants to teach and can also get an idea of what kind of examples are suitable for the material*".⁶¹

Thus, this reinforces that the process of relating lessons to social conditions has been applied to the development activities of subject teachers or *ta'hil*, which are critical indicators. "*When I felt dissatisfied when teaching, I always remembered Ust Hasan's message about intent and motivation to improve teaching*".⁶² Another teacher said, "*I am more confident in teaching after joining ta'hil*".⁶³

The development of homework for teachers is also carried out by PMDG once a week which is named *kemisan*. The activity is mandatory and attended by all PMDG teachers together with the

⁶¹ Results of interview with Ustadz

⁶² Results of interview with Ustadz

⁶³ Results of interview with Ustadz

leaders of the cottage. The hut leader provides direction and insight for all teachers which will then be conveyed to students in teaching and learning activities in and outside the classroom.

E. Discussion

This study aims to explore RT for teachers of *pesantren*. The implications of the findings are discussed as follows in general. The findings provide evidence that *pesantren* teachers have implemented RT properly. They are aware that teaching needs awareness to continuously improve the ways, methods, and material of teaching. Teachers of *pesantren* also know the benefits of RT to improve teacher professionalism.

In addition to improving the professionalism of teachers, it turns out that homework positively affects the relationship between teachers and students in teaching. This is evidenced by the results of moral indicators that show significant result. This finding is different from that carried out by Akbari who considers moral indicators to have no influence on the practice of RT in schools. On the other hand, this research strengthens the evidence that RT is an important indicator for improving the professionalism of teachers.

The improvement of teacher's professionalism is directly related to their ability to think reflectively and the implementation of learning theory in practice. The teachers' quality in learning process plays a very important role in the development of student learning. The development of students' reflective thinking skills could also arise from reflective teachers.⁶⁴ Rationally, a reflective teacher is an individual who focuses on lifelong learning, is development-focused, is open-minded, and can effectively plan and evaluate the teaching process by making self-assessments.⁶⁵

Practical indicators become very important for teachers in the process of implementing RT in *pesantren*. Practical activities and strategies that support improving RT for teachers are *kemisan* and *ta'hil*. Research conducted by Akbari indicates that not all RT indicators for teachers show significant result. The results of this study show that the RT model used in Islamic boarding schools is reflection after action. This is evidenced by the moral indicators that include MO, CG and MC showing high results in table 9. Teachers of *pesantren* think about their teaching, then evaluate the teaching process to improve their teaching later in life.

The practical component including statements related to the tools and practices of reflection showed a low average value. Tools that are commonly used in RT practice contain namely writing journals, making learning reports, conducting surveys, and dividing questionnaires, recording the learning process, class action research, and group discussion.⁶⁶ At this stage, the teachers focus on the

⁶⁴ Şenol Orakcı, "Exploring the Relationships between Cognitive Flexibility, Learner Autonomy, and Reflective Thinking," *Thinking Skills and Creativity* 41 (September 1, 2021): 100838, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2021.100838>.

⁶⁵ Xipei Guo et al., "The Relationship between Epistemological Beliefs, Reflective Thinking, and Science Identity: A Structural Equation Modeling Analysis," *International Journal of STEM Education* 9, no. 1 (June 17, 2022): 40, <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40594-022-00355-x>.

⁶⁶ M. Hanafi, "Perceptions of Reflection on a Pre-Service Primary Teacher Education Programme in Teaching English as a Second Language in an Institute of Teacher Education in Malaysia," 2019,

process, objectives and learning outcomes of their students. Practical reflection also shows the teachers' ability to relate theory to practice. The strategy used by the Islamic education institution is a journal that has been provided by the coordinator of each class, rather than its own initiation. The teachers who fill out the journal are the homeroom teachers and not all subject teachers use the journal to reflect on the learning process while in class.

Marcel Graus et al. finds that there are several ways that support the reflection of teachers, including using blogs or writings to reflect the understanding of students.⁶⁷ This is in line with the napa discovered by Amanda Bowling et al, which states that RT will support the metacognitive improvement of teachers.⁶⁸ This study also found it inconsistent with previous research that the reflectivity of teachers will support the morale of students in the process of interaction during and outside of learning.

Being reflective is also one of the goals to achieve in teachers' learning process. Why? Because being reflective teachers will make it easier for power holders in education to equalize one vision. This similarity is important to cultivate the creative spirit of teachers to think about students in the future.⁶⁹ The dynamics of future life are indeed unpredictable. However, reflective teachers can face it better by looking at situations and conditions that stem from the reflectiveness of their thinking. It also correlates with what penliti gets in the field. Boarding schools with reflective teachers can better predict what the needs of students are. The learning process is interrelated with each other or integration.

The tools used to train the reflectivity of teachers also contribute to the learning process. Maratinelle and Eric Richter highlight that videos with virtual reality can affect the level of reflectivity of teachers.⁷⁰ Likewise, questions that are reflective, can be used by teachers to increase reflectivity so that it has a positive impact on students.⁷¹ Learning supervisors can create questions for teachers to address in their practice reflective thinking of the teaching procedure, such as asking the reason for choosing a learning method in the classroom.

<https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Reflecting-on-Malaysian-Teacher-Trainees%27-Journals.-Yaacob-Walters/998158a3611f272bfd69b37231519a3adc2afcea>.

⁶⁷ Marcel Graus et al., "Disentangling Aspects of Teacher Identity Learning from Reflective Blogs: The Development of a Category System," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 111 (March 1, 2022): 103624, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2021.103624>.

⁶⁸ Amanda Bowling et al., "Agricultural Education Preservice Teachers' Metacognitive Processes and Reflective Observations during a Reflection-in-Action Activity," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 114 (June 1, 2022): 103695, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2022.103695>.

⁶⁹ Maria Jesus Marquez García, Analía Leite Mendez, and William Kirsch, "Novel Metaphors for a Novel School: Narratives, Voices and Experiences from Pre-Service Teachers Engaged in Service-Learning in Spain," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 119 (November 1, 2022): 103840, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2022.103840>.

⁷⁰ Rob Martinelle, "Using Video-Stimulated Recall to Understand the Reflections of Ambitious Social Studies Teachers," *The Journal of Social Studies Research* 44, no. 3 (July 1, 2020): 307–22, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jsr.2020.03.001>.

⁷¹ Tun Zaw Oo and Anita Habók, "Reflection-Based Questioning: Aspects Affecting Myanmar Students' Reading Comprehension," *Heliyon* 8, no. 7 (July 1, 2022): e09864, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2022.e09864>.

Developing RT for teachers requires additional materials and practice. The teacher's decision to master these skills becomes very important. Dewey claims that teachers who apply reflective teaching give clear and precise instructions on how to teach, which is consistent with several subsequent researchers have also spoken of.⁷² Failure to teach RT through teachers' training programs can lead to a shortage of a teacher's way and method of thinking.⁷³ Another finding from this study is that, as long as teachers have awareness and always get advice from Kyai, RT that has experienced problems at the practical level does not seem to be a barrier in the teaching process in pesantren.

Lehesvuori ensures that there is a significant relationship between teacher dialogic and student achievement.⁷⁴ The dialogical in question is an interpretation of a message and question. Therefore, the message or advice of the leader or supervisor greatly influences his opponent. It was kyai's advice that caused the reflectivity of teachers in the pesantren environment to grow. This is due to the continuing factor of giving advice from the beginning of entry into a student to eventually becoming a teacher. Similarly, Muhonen also claimed that reflective teachers cannot spontaneously be reflective. There are two driving factors, namely: Providing reflective thinking training in the early stages of career and teaching experience.⁷⁵

What is interesting to be reviewed further is the existence of interventions in the learning process in pesantren by power holders. The intervention is in the form of reporting materials and learning plans to the supervisor on the day on which the teacher teaches. As a result, teachers must carry out learning by thinking about what methods, materials, and materials will be used in teaching. Research on the impact of these interventions has been conducted by Gastager who states interventions are drivers of teacher openness and reflectivity in their learning process.⁷⁶

F. Conclusion

The results of this study showed some interesting new findings. RT for teachers in pesantren has been implemented well. Pesantren, which is full of Islamic religious teaching, has carried out reflective teaching constructs. The strategies used in pesantren to improve RT are *ta'hil* (deepening of the substance), *kemisan* observation (weekly evaluation), and classroom action research. However, other strategies such as journal writing, and audio or video recording have not been widely carried out and are rarely used. This study's significant implication is that Kyai's suggestion is essential for teachers

⁷² Dewey, *How We Think*.

⁷³ Artamonova, "Reflective Practices."

⁷⁴ Sami Lehesvuori et al., "Reflections on Dialogicity: Challenges and Suggestions by Mathematics Student Teachers," *Learning, Culture and Social Interaction* 31 (December 1, 2021): 100567, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lcsi.2021.100567>.

⁷⁵ Heli Muhonen, Eija Pakarinen, and Marja-Kristiina Lerkkanen, "Do Teachers' Professional Vision and Teaching Experience Always Go Hand in Hand? Examining Knowledge-Based Reasoning of Finnish Grade 1 Teachers," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 106 (October 1, 2021): 103458, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2021.103458>.

⁷⁶ Angela Gastager et al., "Fostering Preservice Teachers' Openness to Educational Theory and Self-Regulation as Elements of Their Epistemic Reflective Competence: Results from a Mixed-Methods Intervention Study in Austria," *International Journal of Educational Research* 112 (January 1, 2022): 101918, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2021.101918>.

at pesantren. This is to be noted since the kyai's advice always included instructions for teaching philosophy, methodologies, and techniques.

The findings in this study showed that most of practical, cognitive, affective, meta cognitive and moral indicators are positive for teachers in pesantren, except the practical indicators. These data suggested that teachers needed discipline to adopt RT. The RT model used in pesantren is reflection after action. Meanwhile, principal awarness is a significant differentiator between RT for teachers in schools and pesantren. These findings still cannot be generalized widely because the samples used are limited. Further research needs to consider a broader and larger sample and how RT for teachers is applied at all levels of *pesantren* education.

G. Bibliography

- Ahsanu, Muhamad. "Reflective Practice and Teaching Creativity of Indonesian ELT Practitioners within the Postmethod Paradigm." In *Proceedings of the ProcCulture, Education, Linguistics and Literature*, 1:123. Purwokerto, Indonesia: EAI, 2019. <https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.5-8-2019.2289784>.
- Akbari, Ramin, Foad Behzadpoor, and Babak Dadvand. "Development of English Language Teaching Reflection Inventory." *System* 38, no. 2 (June 2010): 211–27. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2010.03.003>.
- A'la, Bassam Abul. "The ideal teacher from the perspective of Abu Hasan Al Mawardi." Institut Studi Islam Darussalam (ISID) Gontor, 2016. https://scholar.google.co.id/citations?view_op=view_citation&hl=en&user=YNEY644AAAAJ&citation_for_view=YNEY644AAAAJ:qjMakFHDy7sC.
- A'la, Bassam Abul, and Moh. Rifqi Rahman. "The Response From Pesantren Recognition in The Configuration of The National Education System." *AJIS: Academic Journal of Islamic Studies* 7, no. 2 (December 27, 2022): 323. <https://doi.org/10.29240/ajis.v7i2.5136>.
- Alsina, Ángel, Sara Ayllón, Jordi Colomer, Rosario Fernández-Peña, Judit Fullana, Maria Pallisera, Marc Pérez-Burriel, and Laura Serra. "Improving and Evaluating Reflective Narratives: A Rubric for Higher Education Students." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 63 (April 1, 2017): 148–58. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2016.12.015>.
- Anjaria, Kushal. "Knowledge Derivation from Likert Scale Using Z-Numbers." *Information Sciences* 590 (April 2022): 234–52. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ins.2022.01.024>.
- Artamonova, Xeniya S. "Reflective Practices: The Experiences of Teachers in One NIS School in Kazakhstan." Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education, 2017.
- Badri, Yusuf, Hepsi Nindiasari, and Abdul Fatah. "Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Interaktif Dengan Scaffolding Metakognitif Untuk Kemampuan Dan Disposisi Berpikir Reflektif Matematis Siswa." *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pembelajaran Matematika* 12, no. 1 (February 19, 2019). <https://doi.org/10.30870/jppm.v12i1.4863>.
- Bassachs, Marcel, Dolors Cañabate, Lluís Nogué, Teresa Serra, Remigijus Bubnys, and Jordi Colomer. "Fostering Critical Reflection in Primary Education through STEAM Approaches." *Education Sciences* 10, no. 12 (December 16, 2020): 384. <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci10120384>.

- Bell, Amani, Jill Kelton, Nadia McDonagh, Rosina Mladenovic, and Kellie Morrison. "A Critical Evaluation of the Usefulness of a Coding Scheme to Categorise Levels of Reflective Thinking." *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education* 36, no. 7 (December 2011): 797–815. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02602938.2010.488795>.
- Black, Susan. "Teaching Students to Think Critically." *Education Digest: Essential Readings Condensed for Quick Review* 70, no. 6 (February 2005): 42–47.
- Bowling, Amanda, Aaron Giorgi, Caryn Filson, and Tracy Kitchel. "Agricultural Education Preservice Teachers' Metacognitive Processes and Reflective Observations during a Reflection-in-Action Activity." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 114 (June 1, 2022): 103695. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2022.103695>.
- Burbank, Mary, Laurie Ramirez, and Alisa Bates. "Critically Reflective Thinking in Urban Teacher Education: A Comparative Case Study of Two Participants' Experiences as Content Area Teachers." *Professional Educator* 36, no. 2 (2012). <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ988205>.
- Choy, S. Chee, and Phaik Kin Cheah. "Teacher Perceptions of Critical Thinking among Students and Its Influence on Higher Education." *International Journal of Research in Science and Technology* 20, no. 2 (2009). <https://doi.org/10.37648/ijrst.v10i04.002>.
- Choy, S. Chee, and Pou San Oo. *Reflective Thinking and Teaching Practices: A Precursor for Incorporating Critical Thinking into the Classroom? Online Submission*. Vol. 5, 2012. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED529110>.
- Colomer, Jordi, Teresa Serra, Dolors Cañabate, and Remigijus Bubnys. "Reflective Learning in Higher Education: Active Methodologies for Transformative Practices." *Sustainability* 12, no. 9 (May 8, 2020): 3827. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su12093827>.
- Creswell, John W., and Vicki L. Plano Clark. *Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research*. Third Edition. Los Angeles: SAGE, 2018.
- Dewey, John. *How We Think: A Restatement of the Relation of Reflective Thinking to the Educative Process*. Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath, 1933.
- Farrell, Thomas S. C. *Reflective Practice in Action: 80 Reflection Breaks for Busy Teachers*. Thousand Oaks, Calif: Corwin Press, 2004.
- Ferraro, Joan M. *Reflective Practice and Professional Development*. American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, 1307 New York Avenue, 2000.
- Fives, Helenrose, and Michelle M. Buehl. "Exploring Differences in Practicing Teachers' Valuing of Pedagogical Knowledge Based on Teaching Ability Beliefs." *Journal of Teacher Education* 65, no. 5 (November 2014): 435–48. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487114541813>.
- Gastager, Angela, Gerda Hagenauer, Daniela Moser, and Erika Rottensteiner. "Fostering Preservice Teachers' Openness to Educational Theory and Self-Regulation as Elements of Their Epistemic Reflective Competence: Results from a Mixed-Methods Intervention Study in Austria." *International Journal of Educational Research* 112 (January 1, 2022): 101918. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2021.101918>.
- Gontor, Pondok Modern Darussalam. "Sejarah Latar Belakang Pondok Modern Darussalam Gontor." <https://www.gontor.ac.id>, August 25, 2020. <https://www.gontor.ac.id/latar-belakang>.

- Graus, Marcel, Ankie van de Broek, Paul Hennissen, and Trudie Schils. "Disentangling Aspects of Teacher Identity Learning from Reflective Blogs: The Development of a Category System." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 111 (March 1, 2022): 103624. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2021.103624>.
- Guo, Xipei, Xuemin Hao, Wenbo Deng, Xin Ji, Shuoqi Xiang, and Weiping Hu. "The Relationship between Epistemological Beliefs, Reflective Thinking, and Science Identity: A Structural Equation Modeling Analysis." *International Journal of STEM Education* 9, no. 1 (June 17, 2022): 40. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40594-022-00355-x>.
- Hanafi, M. "Perceptions of Reflection on a Pre-Service Primary Teacher Education Programme in Teaching English as a Second Language in an Institute of Teacher Education in Malaysia," 2019. <https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Reflecting-on-Malaysian-Teacher-Trainees%27-Journals.-Yaacob-Walters/998158a3611f272bfd69b37231519a3adc2afcea>.
- Hanafi, Yusuf, Ahmad Taufiq, Muhammad Saefi, M. Alifudin Ikhsan, Tsania Nur Diyana, Titis Thoriquttyas, and Faris Khoirul Anam. "The New Identity of Indonesian Islamic Boarding Schools in the 'New Normal': The Education Leadership Response to COVID-19." *Heliyon* 7, no. 3 (March 2021): e06549. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e06549>.
- Hansen, David T. *Exploring the Moral Heart of Teaching: Toward a Teacher's Creed*. New York: Teachers College Press, 2001.
- Hoyle, Eric, and Jacquetta Megarry, eds. *World Yearbook of Education 1980*. 0 ed. Routledge, 2012. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203080511>.
- Hung, Do Minh, and Pham Trut Thuy. "Reflective Teaching Perceived and Practiced by EFL Teachers - A Case in the South of Vietnam." *International Journal of Instruction* 14, no. 2 (April 1, 2021): 323–44. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2021.14219a>.
- Keshavarz, Sussan. "Quran Point of View on Dimensions of Reflection and Its Indications in Education System." *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 9 (2010): 1812–14. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2010.12.405>.
- Killion, Joellen P., and Guy R. Todnem. "A Process for Personal Theory Building." *Educational Leadership* 48 (1991): 14–16.
- Kosim, Mohammad, Faqihul Muqoddam, Faidol Mubarak, and Nur Quma Laila. "The Dynamics of Islamic Education Policies in Indonesia." *Cogent Education* 10, no. 1 (December 31, 2023): 2172930. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2023.2172930>.
- Lee, Hea-Jin. "Understanding and Assessing Preservice Teachers' Reflective Thinking." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 21, no. 6 (August 2005): 699–715. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2005.05.007>.
- Lehesvuori, Sami, Markus Hähkiöniemi, Laura Ketonen, Marja-Kristiina Lerkkanen, Sanni Pöysä, and Eija Pakarinen. "Reflections on Dialogicity: Challenges and Suggestions by Mathematics Student Teachers." *Learning, Culture and Social Interaction* 31 (December 1, 2021): 100567. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lcsi.2021.100567>.
- Lukens-Bull, Ronald. "Madrassa By Any Other Name: Pondok, Pesantren, and Islamic Schools in Indonesia and Larger Southeast Asian Region." *Journal Of Indonesian Islam* 4, no. 1 (June 1, 2010): 1. <https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2010.4.1.1-21>.
- Manurung, Santy Yesica, and Tanti Listiani. "Becoming a Reflective Teacher through the Reflective Thinking Process in Mathematics Learning." *Polyglot: Jurnal Ilmiah* 16, no. 1 (January 30, 2020): 58. <https://doi.org/10.19166/pji.v16i1.2262>.

- Marquez García, Maria Jesus, Analía Leite Mendez, and William Kirsch. "Novel Metaphors for a Novel School: Narratives, Voices and Experiences from Pre-Service Teachers Engaged in Service-Learning in Spain." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 119 (November 1, 2022): 103840. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2022.103840>.
- Martinelle, Rob. "Using Video-Stimulated Recall to Understand the Reflections of Ambitious Social Studies Teachers." *The Journal of Social Studies Research* 44, no. 3 (July 1, 2020): 307–22. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jssr.2020.03.001>.
- Mawardi al, Abu al Hasan Ali bin Muhammad. *Adabu ad Dunnya wa ad Diin*. 1st ed. Vol. 1. Konstantinopel: Jawaib Press, 1882.
- Memon, Nadeem. "What Islamic School Teachers Want: Towards Developing an Islamic Teacher Education Programme." *British Journal of Religious Education* 33, no. 3 (September 2011): 285–98. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2011.595912>.
- Montrose, Lynne. "International Study and Experiential Learning: The Academic Context," 2002. <https://doi.org/10.36366/frontiers.v8i1.91>.
- Muhonen, Heli, Eija Pakarinen, and Marja-Kristiina Lerkkanen. "Do Teachers' Professional Vision and Teaching Experience Always Go Hand in Hand? Examining Knowledge-Based Reasoning of Finnish Grade 1 Teachers." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 106 (October 1, 2021): 103458. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2021.103458>.
- Nawas, Abu, I Gusti Ngurah Darmawan, and Nina Maadad. "Single-Sex 'Pesantren' Schools: Unravelling Girls' and Boys' Peer Connections and Their Impacts on Wellbeing and Learning Outcomes." *International Journal of Educational Research* 125 (2024): 102339. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2024.102339>.
- Nian, Zhaohao. "To Promote the Development of Teachers' Teaching Beliefs from Reflective Teaching." *Open Journal of Social Sciences* 08, no. 11 (2020): 120–26. <https://doi.org/10.4236/jss.2020.811012>.
- Nismawati, Nismawati, Hepsi Nindiasari, and Anwar Mutaqin. "Meningkatkan Kemampuan Berpikir Reflektif Matematis Melalui Model Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning Berbasis Lingkungan." *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pembelajaran Matematika* 12, no. 1 (February 19, 2019). <https://doi.org/10.30870/jppm.v12i1.4856>.
- Oo, Tun Zaw, and Anita Habók. "Reflection-Based Questioning: Aspects Affecting Myanmar Students' Reading Comprehension." *Heliyon* 8, no. 7 (July 1, 2022): e09864. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2022.e09864>.
- Orakçı, Şenol. "Exploring the Relationships between Cognitive Flexibility, Learner Autonomy, and Reflective Thinking." *Thinking Skills and Creativity* 41 (September 1, 2021): 100838. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2021.100838>.
- Pagano, Monica, and Laura Roselle. "Beyond Reflection through an Academic Lens: Refraction and International Experiential Education." *Frontiers: The Interdisciplinary Journal of Study Abroad* 18 (2009): 217–29.
- Palacios, Nancy, and Alison Kay Reedy. "Teaching Practicums as an Ideal Setting for the Development of Teachers-in-Training." *Revista Interuniversitaria de Formación Del Profesorado. Continuación de La Antigua Revista de Escuelas Normales* 97, no. 36.1 (April 18, 2022). <https://doi.org/10.47553/rifop.v97i36.1.89267>.

Bassam Abul A'laa, Xiaohui Sun, Masdar Hilmy, Suryani

- Patriadi, Himawan Bayu, Mohd. Zaini Abu Bakar, and Zahri Hamat. "Human Security in Local Wisdom Perspective: Pesantren and Its Responsibility to Protect People." *Procedia Environmental Sciences* 28 (2015): 100–105. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.proenv.2015.07.015>.
- Pollard, Andrew, and Kristine Black-Hawkins. *Reflective Teaching in Schools*. 4th edition. Reflective Teaching. London ; New York: Bloomsbury, 2014.
- Postholm, May Britt. "Teachers Developing Practice: Reflection as Key Activity." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 24, no. 7 (October 2008): 1717–28. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2008.02.024>.
- Raihani. "Report on Multicultural Education in Pesantren." *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education* 42, no. 4 (July 2012): 585–605. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2012.672255>.
- Schön, Donald A. *Educating the Reflective Practitioner: Toward a New Design for Teaching and Learning in the Professions*. The Jossey-Bass Higher Education Series. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1990.
- Stough, Talia, Kim Ceulemans, W. Lambrechts, and V. Cappuyns. "Assessing Sustainability in Higher Education Curricula: A Critical Reflection on Validity Issues," 2018. <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.JCLEPRO.2017.02.017>.
- Sugiyono. *Metode penelitian kuantitatif, kualitatif dan kombinasi (mixed methods)*. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2018.
- Tim Lajnah Pentashihan Mushaf Al Quran. *Tafsir Ringkas*. 1st ed. Jakarta: Lajnah Pentashihan Mushaf Al Quran, 2016.
- Uthman Sulaiman, Kabuye. "An Exposition of the Islamic Perspective of Reflection: Meaning, Entailment and Significance." *International Journal of Management Studies and Social Science Research* 3, no. 2 (2021).
- Valdez, Paolo Nino, Jocelyn Amor Navera, and Jerico Juan Esteron. "What Is Reflective Teaching? Lessons Learned from ELT Teachers from the Philippines." *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher* 27, no. 2 (April 2018): 91–98. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40299-018-0368-3>.
- Vazir, Nilofar. "Reflection in Action: Constructing Narratives of Experience." *Reflective Practice* 7, no. 4 (November 2006): 445–54. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623940600987015>.
- Wekke, Ismail Suardi. "Arabic Teaching and Learning: A Model from Indonesian Muslim Minority." *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 191 (June 2015): 286–90. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.04.236>.
- Yusuf, Muhammad, and Ismail Suardi Wekke. "Active Learning on Teaching Arabic for Special Purpose in Indonesian Pesantren." *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 191 (June 2015): 137–41. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.04.245>.
- Zeichner, Kenneth M., and Daniel P. Liston. *Reflective Teaching: An Introduction*. 2. ed. Reflective Teaching and the Social Conditions of Schooling. London: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2014.